LEARNING
to realize education’s promise

#wdr2018
Kenya, Tanzania, and Uganda

“The name of the dog is Puppy”

Could understand

Grade 3
Kenya, Tanzania, and Uganda

“The name of the dog is Puppy”

Could not understand

Grade 3
Rural India

46

\[ -17 \]

Could not solve

Grade 3
Rural India

46
- 17

?  

Could not solve

Grade 5
Brazil

Progress in Math (PISA 15 year olds)
Brazil

**Time to reach OECD average in Math (PISA 15 year olds)**

75 years
Brazil

Time to reach OECD average in Math and Reading (PISA 15 year olds)

>260 years
Percent of end-of primary students who meet a minimum proficiency threshold for learning in math?

- High income countries
- Upper-middle income countries
- Lower-middle income countries
- Low income countries
High inequalities in learning

PASEC 2014: Percent of students performing at each competency level (end of primary)
Remaining inequities in access

Percentage of youth (ages 15–19) who have completed each grade (2012)
Education has great promise

Jobs and higher earnings
Reduced poverty

Productivity and growth
Poverty reduction

Healthier and better-educated families
Resilience and adaptability

Better institutions/service delivery
Civic engagement and social cohesion
Education has great promise, but too often it doesn’t deliver

Education can’t do it alone... …but it can do much better on learning
Immediate causes of the learning crisis

How do teaching and learning break down?
Immediate causes of the learning crisis
Immediate causes of the learning crisis

Non-deprived infant

Infant exposed to high deprivation
Immediate causes of the learning crisis

Percentage of children ages 3–5 who can recognize 10 letters of the alphabet

- a. Central African Republic
- b. Kazakhstan

- 100%
- 80%
- 60%
- 40%
- 20%
- 0%
Immediate causes of the learning crisis

- Unskilled and unmotivated teachers
- Unprepared learners
- School management
- School inputs

### Chart

- **Percent**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Teachers absent from the classroom</th>
<th>Teachers absent from the school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uganda, 2013</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mozambique, 2014</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania, 2010</td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya, 2012</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania, 2014</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo, 2013</td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal, 2011</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria, 2013</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Immediate causes of the learning crisis

Brazil: One Laptop Per Child initiative

Sierra Leone: Textbooks distribution
Immediate causes of the learning crisis
Deeper causes of the learning crisis

Why are these problems allowed to persist?
Barriers to learning at scale

**Technical complexity**

Coherence between elements is hard, e.g. curriculum, teacher preparation, evaluation, student assessment

*Lack of coherence undermined teacher effectiveness in South Africa in the early 2000s*
Deeper causes of the learning crisis

Barriers to learning at scale

Political economy

Multiple actors have competing objectives, driving misalignment and incoherence

Political negotiation undermined teacher pay reform in Indonesia in the late 2000s

→ Systems are stuck in a low-learning, low-accountability, high-inequality equilibrium
Don’t give up: Success is possible
Don’t give up: Success is possible

→ Sustained improvement: Republic of Korea
→ Remarkable performance: Vietnam
→ Profound reforms: Peru
→ Rapid progress in reading: India, Liberia, Papua New Guinea
→ Broad-based approach to improvement: Malaysia, Tanzania
Countries need to take action showing that learning really matters to them.
Assess learning to make it a serious goal
Assess learning through measurement

Assess learning ....

... to shine a light on the hidden exclusion of low learning
Assess learning through measurement

Many countries don’t know whether students are learning: Percent of countries in each region with a nationally representative learning assessment

Source: UIS 2016.
Act on evidence to make schools work for all learners
Act to improve learning at student, classroom and school levels

Ensure learners are prepared and motivated
- ECD
- Cash transfers
- Remediation

Jamaica: 25% higher earnings from ECD

Burkina Faso: 20% increase in girls’ enrollment from cash transfers
Act to improve learning at student, classroom and school levels

Ensure teachers are skilled and motivated
- Better professional development
- Career-based incentives
- Teaching to the level of the students

Liberia: 2x reading fluency from pedagogical training

Kenya: All students improved from ability grouping
Act to improve learning at student, classroom and school levels

United States: Student learning increased by ≈0.2 SD from principal management training

India: 2X rate of learning from adaptive software

Ensure school investments help students learn from teachers
- Relevant infrastructure
- Effective technology
- Management training
Align actors to make the whole system work for learning
Align actors by tackling technical and political barriers

Tools for breaking out of low-learning traps

Information and metrics

Coalitions and incentives

Innovation and agility
Align actors by tackling technical and political barriers

Make **learning** salient

Tanzania

- School-leaving exam scores +
- UWEZO citizen-led assessment +
- Service Delivery Indicators

→ Political pressure
→ Large-scale education reform program
Align actors by tackling technical and political barriers

Forge **coalitions** for learning

**Chile**
- Long-term negotiated reform process
- Confidence-building and opt-in reforms

**Malaysia**
- Lab model: Two-month exercise with all key players
- Planning and decision-making

**Coalitions and incentives**
Align actors by tackling technical and political barriers

Figure out how to improve learning in the **local context**

**Burundi**
- Adaptive approach successfully distributed textbooks in post-conflict setting

**India**
- Experiment showed grouping students by ability level worked
- Then NGO tested variants at scale (with government)

**Innovation and agility**
Align actors by tackling technical and political barriers

External actors and strategic change

Information and metrics
Coalitions and incentives
Innovation and agility
An aligned system focused on learning
An aligned system focused on learning

**Assess** learning to make it a serious goal

**Act** on evidence to make schools work for all learners

**Align** actors to make the whole system work for learning
LEARNING
TO REALIZE EDUCATION’S PROMISE

Get the puzzle app at the Apple Store
Search for “WDR 2018”
Spending and learning
Simple associations between spending and learning are weak
Spending for learning?

Spending and learning

- **Peru**

  - Spending per student, PPP
  - Average LLECE Score

  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Spending per student, PPP</th>
<th>Average LLECE Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1400</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Spending for learning?

Spending and learning don’t always move together

[Graphs showing spending per student and average LLECE Score for Peru and Paraguay across 2006 and 2013.]
Spending for learning?

Spending and learning don’t always move together

- **Peru**: Increased spending with a slight decrease in average LLECE Score.
- **Paraguay**: Increased spending with a decrease in average LLECE Score.
- **Guatemala**: Decreased spending with an increase in average LLECE Score.
Spending and learning don’t always move together

Kenya

Lesotho
Spending and learning don’t always move together

**Spending per student, PPP**

- **Kenya**
- **Lesotho**
- **Malawi**

**Average SACMEQ Score**

- **Kenya**
- **Lesotho**
- **Malawi**
Spending for learning?

Weak links in the chain between spending and learning

• Spending is not allocated equitably
• Funds do not reach schools or are not used for their intended purposes
• Public spending can substitute for private spending
• Decisions on the use of public funding are not coherently aligned with learning
• Government agencies lack the capacity to use funding effectively
Spending for learning?

Weak links in the chain between spending and learning

- Spending is not allocated equitably

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Year(s)</th>
<th>Primary</th>
<th>Secondary</th>
<th>Tertiary</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Poorest</td>
<td>Richest</td>
<td>Poorest</td>
<td>Richest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burundi</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congo, Rep.</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honduras</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>2007–08</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>2009–10</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LEARNING
TO REALIZE EDUCATION’S PROMISE